

Report of the Ad Hoc Group on next steps for IEEE Std. C37.100.1:2018

Purpose of the Ad Hoc:

The latest revision of IEEE C37.100.1:2018 was completed quite quickly to resolve an issue with the IEC Central Office refusing to grant copyright clearance for material in IEEE PC37.100.1/Draft 8 (2016) which substantially duplicated material in IEC 62271-1:2017. Because C37.100.1:2007 would be administratively withdrawn on 12/31/2018 it was urgent to complete a revision of that document. The initial ballot for PC37.100.1 had a substantial number of comments which were either rejected or resolved by revising the document in some manner other than the manner suggested by the commenter. The subsequent ballot passed, but some doubt remains whether the original commenters were fully satisfied. The new revision of C37.100.1:2018 is also substantially different than the previously balloted and approved (by IEEE PES) PC37.100.1/ Draft 8. Much of the new work that was included in Draft 8 had to be sacrificed to meet the IEC copyright criteria.

The Ad Hoc was charged to determine how best to proceed. Options discussed included:

1. Pursuing a joint working group with IEC in order create a joint IEC/IEEE 62271-1 (Common Requirements for High Voltage Controlgear).
2. Revise C37.100.1:2018 -- either by working 'backward' from PC37.100.1/D8 or 'forward' from PC37.100.1:2018 (which is effectively a lightly modified C37.100.1:2007) -- To be determined by the WG if this option is selected.
3. Do nothing and let C37.100.1:2018 run through normal revision process.
4. Create a Recommended Practice to aid working groups to reference IEC 62271-1:2017 directly in a manner which is consistent with the content of Draft 8 of PC37.100.1. For example, substituting IEEE Std. 4 for IEC 60060. At the same time consider pursuing a Joint Standard dependent on the acceptance of usage of IEC 62271-1:2017.

Discussion:

One of the most cited concerns cited by participants with respect to use of a common clauses document was a perceived "loss of control" by the parent document should the common clauses document change. Efforts were made to explain that all references to a common clauses document are (1) only inserted in the first place by an action of the equipment standards WG to include the reference and (2) all such references must be dated references such that any revision to the common clause document does not 'automatically' roll up to the new revision without an explicit action of the equipment WG during a revision or amendment process.

Another concern was that use of a common requirements document, may require additional normative references to be purchases. Reference to IEC 62271-1 could lead to a great many IEC normative references being required. Such a risk may be higher with references to IEC 62271-1 and there is no guarantee that a joint standard would include dual equivalent references. In each case, as noted above, the equipment standards WG could mitigate any such consequences by not citing the common clause document or modifying the citation requirements. Of course, such mitigation activities lessen the usefulness of a common clause documents.

Balance:

73 individuals participated in the Ad Hoc. 54 of those present voted for one option or another or officially abstained, therefore 21 individuals either left the meeting after signing in or simply did not vote. Although the meeting of the Ad Hoc was advertised to all members and interested individuals of the switchgear committee HVF, HVS and RODE were poorly represented. Of the 73 participating individuals 63 have recorded attendance in one or more subcommittee meetings. 80 % are either HVCB or SA; 3 or fewer attendees are members of any of the remaining subcommittees.

Results:

By approximately a 3:2 ratio, the Ad Hoc recommends to ADSCOM that a revision to C37.100.1:2018 is the preferred solution. The Ad Hoc recommends that a PAR be authorized and circulated via electronic ballot to the members of the Ad Hoc (thus converting the Ad Hoc to a Study Group) with the task of creating a revision PAR for C37.100.1:2018 to be submitted to NESCOM in time that a WG could begin work at the Fall 2019 meeting.

John C. Webb
Chair, Ad Hoc Group for C37.100.1